

MINUTES

COUNCIL ON RECYCLING
DECEMBER 12, 2006
KEGONSA ROOM
ALLIANT ENERGY CENTER
1919 ALLIANT ENERGY CENTER WAY
MADISON, WISCONSIN

Council Members Present: Neil Peters-Michaud; John Piotrowski; John Reindl; Cecelia Stencil
William Swift; Charlotte Zieve

Council Members Absent: Jeff Fielkow

Also attending: Cynthia Moore, DNR; Joe Van Rossum, SHWEC.

Call To Order: The meeting was called to order by Chair John Reindl at 9:00 AM.

Introductions and Announcements: Reindl said that there was a front-page article in the Wisconsin State Journal about pharmaceuticals. The article discussed narcotics and security but did not mention producer responsibility. He said the Wisconsin State Journal also ran a letter to the editor from Suzanne Bangert about the one-day electronics roundup in Madison.

Minutes: Approval of the Minutes of September 25, 2006. Charlotte Zieve moved, Bill Swift seconded. The minutes were approved.

Reports

DNR: Cynthia Moore, DNR, said that the Natural Resources Board approved a budget initiative taking \$3 million from the recycling fund to use for environmental results. They also supported the Midwest policy approach to e-waste and agreed to look at restructuring the recycling program to be more performance based. This would allow RUs to use funds for other recycling activities. Moore said that unspent demonstration grant funds were being used to contract with non-profits. This year a contract for \$24,000 was bid to develop ideas for business recycling. By statute, this money can only go to non-profits.

Moore said that DNR was working on the Midwest e-waste initiative. Presentations will be made by representatives of the group to the Council on State Governments and the Council of Environmental Legislators. The National Council of State Legislatures approved a resolution supporting the Midwest Initiative and the North East Recycling Council approach. The DNR will be working with Sen. Miller on an e-waste bill next year.

Moore said the final decisions for recycling demonstration grants have been made. She will send a list of the projects to the Council. Moore said DNR demonstration grant program will have RFP's for organics, C&D and business outreach in the spring of 2007.

Moore said that a Midwest Product Stewardship Council is being formed. The first conference call will be December 15.

Neil Peters-Michaud asked why DNR was outsourcing so many activities. Moore replied that DNR lacked the staff for all of the different. She said the DNR is trying to tap into the great reserves of talent in the state. The DNR sees a need to support non-profit groups. Reindl said there is a need to build staff awareness and transfer institutional memory. He has seen members of the task force address ideas that have already been tried and found not to work. Institutional memory is important.

Governor's Task Force on Waste Materials Recovery and Disposal: Reindl said the last meeting of the task force is this afternoon. The twenty members represented a wide variety of interests, including municipalities, waste industry, manufacturing and environmentalists. One

of the most difficult things to do was to assign costs to externalities. The task force tries to make relative values for the environmental costs of different actions. He said an example would be comparing recycling to landfilling. The apparent costs of each are about \$100/ton. However, the net benefits to society of recycling vs. the net costs of extracting and using virgin material yielded a difference of \$450/ton. So, if all factors were accounted for, you could pay \$450/ton for recycling and still break even. Recommendations include having to complete a course in environmental economics as a requirement for a degree in environmental studies and another is for the creation of a position of environmental economist in the DNR.

Reindl said the recommendations are in five categories: Minimizing environmental, economic and social costs; Enhancing producer responsibility for products; Promoting effective resource recycling and recovery; Promoting responsible waste disposal; and Promoting ecological and environmental stability. Issues they have taken up that are of special interest to the council include bans on disposal of some materials by individuals, used oil filters and absorbents, pharmaceuticals and open burning. He said that 36 of the 45 issues got the support of over 75% of the task force membership.

Reindl said the report will go to the Governor by the end of the year. He expects several of the recommendations to go forward either through the budget, by individual legislators and by the agencies. The task force working group will continue as a working group to monitor the progress of the recommendations even though it will be technically dissolved at the end of the year.

Reindl said he wishes the task force would have done more on regional solid waste authority. Peters-Michaud said that the Council and other groups had to champion issues to keep them from being forgotten. Reindl said many members of the task force were not familiar with the council or some other groups that may weigh in on these issues.

Paper: John Piotrowski said that a conference call was held on October 18, 2006 and a consensus was reached. 'Environmentally benign adhesives' (EBA) has been changed to 'recycling compatible adhesives' (RCA) to better reflect the attributes of the adhesives. He said that the Tag and Label Manufacturers Institute (TMLI) will post standards and protocols necessary to receive the RCA designation and make them available to DNR to post on their web site. Piotrowski said he was very impressed with the work ethic of the group. Forty-two people from all over the country met in person and by teleconference and put together the protocol in less than six months. That is quite an achievement. Wisconsin is the first state to develop these protocols and leads the nation in this area. Reindl said that Piotrowski also deserves a lot of credit for his leadership. It would not have gotten done without his efforts.

Reindl said that he has talked to purchasing agents in Wisconsin and they will take this issue to their national conferences. He said this is a classic 'chicken/egg' issue. The manufacturers have a product but they won't go into production until there is a demand. There will not be a demand unless the product is available. Hopefully, this is the first step to break the cycle. Reindl said he will be writing an article for *Resource Recycling* on this issue.

Piotrowski warned that this will not solve the problem. There are thousands of paper-to-paper adhesive applications and this will only affect a small percentage. Office paper, glass contamination, single stream recycling and other issues will still have to be addressed by manufacturers. However, this is a step forward. The savings for manufacturers will not be seen for some time. It may be years before enough companies switch over to RCA's to make a difference. There will be costs to adhesive manufacturers and adhesive users that will slow the changeover. Piotrowski said that one thing he learned was that few companies looked at the whole picture to see what affect their product had on the whole picture. Paper companies had been talking about this issue for years but never talked to the adhesives manufacturers about it until now. Most users did not even know that stickies were a problem for recyclers. Piotrowski said that the TMLI sub-committee supported the resolution.

Zieve moved and Cecelia Stencil seconded the resolution. Peters-Michaud suggested that Piotrowski write a preamble talking about the forty-two participants and that all the major players were represented and supported the resolution. Zieve accepted that as a friendly amendment to her motion. Piotrowski said he would write a preamble. The motion passed as amended on a voice vote.

Electronics: Charlotte Zieve asked Peters-Michaud to take over the Chair of the committee since he was such an expert in the field. Peters-Michaud said he would accept the chair. Peters-Michaud said there was a great push from the states to do something about e-waste. He said that China was cracking down. If caught china imposes a 2% tariff on all products imported by that company. That is a stiff penalty in a low margin business. He said that DNR has done good work on best practices. He said we need rules to protect health and safety.

Reindl said he expects Sen. Miller to introduce his bill on e-waste early in the session. The big issue is the budget and that pushes all other issues to the side. The issue is most likely to come up in the fall. Peters-Michaud said that Minnesota now has a ban on e-waste. There was an article in the St Paul Pioneer Press about an increase in illegal dumping due to the new law. Peters-Michaud said there is a need to tie the ban to a funding mechanism. A regional approach makes sense.

Mercury in Products: Reindl said that Mercury Free Wisconsin was pushing a ban on mercury in products. Michigan had four mercury product bills pass there last year. Ohio has four mercury product bills progressing through the legislature. He expects legislation to be introduced in Wisconsin next year.

Clean Sweep: Reindl said that DATCP has requested increased funding for clean sweeps from the recycling fund. They want to double the funding from \$710,000 to \$1.4 million. Cecelia Stencil said it doesn't make sense to use recycling funds for clean sweeps. Reindl said that the task force talked about having manufacturers pay for more of the clean sweep materials. Peters Michaud said manufacturers should take them to limit liability. There was talk about expanding the uses of the recycling fund. Joe Van Rossum said that DATCP also has proposed using the recycling fund for a bio-fuels initiative.

Public Comment: None

Other Business : The next meeting will be following the AROW/WCSWMA/SWANA training conference at the Radisson Paper Valley Hotel, 333 W. college Ave, Appleton on Friday, February 23, 2007.

Adjournment: Stencil moved, Zieve seconded. The Council adjourned at 10:50 AM.

Respectfully submitted by Daniel B. Fields, Department of Natural Resources.